



South Coast Air Quality Management District

21865 Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, CA 91765-4178
(909) 396-2000 • www.aqmd.gov

SENT VIA E-MAIL AND USPS:

May 23, 2019

nmith@carson.ca.us

Nancy Mith, Planner
City of Carson, Community Development Department
Planning Division
701 East Carson Street
Carson, CA 90745

Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) for the Proposed Brandywine Residential Project

South Coast Air Quality Management District (South Coast AQMD) staff appreciates the opportunity to comment on the above-mentioned document. The following comments are meant as guidance for the Lead Agency and should be incorporated into the Final MND.

South Coast AQMD Staff's Summary of Project Description

The Lead Agency proposes to construct 38 residential units totaling 86,042 square feet on 1.57 acres (Proposed Project). The Proposed Project is located at 1007 East Victoria Street on the northwest corner of East Victoria Street and Cedarbluff Way. Upon review of the MND and aerial photographs, South Coast AQMD staff found that there are residential units located within 25 meters of the Proposed Project¹. The Proposed Project is expected to be constructed over 18 months² and becomes operational in 2021³.

South Coast AQMD Staff's Summary of Air Quality Analyses

In the Air Quality Analysis section, the Lead Agency quantified the Proposed Project's construction and operational emissions and compared those emissions to South Coast AQMD's recommended regional and localized air quality CEQA significance thresholds. Based on the analysis, the Lead Agency found that the Proposed Project's regional and localized construction and operational air quality impacts would be less than significant⁴.

South Coast AQMD Staff's General Comments

South Coast AQMD staff has comments on the localized significance thresholds (LSTs) air quality analysis. Residential uses are located within 25 meters of the Proposed Project. However, the Lead Agency compared the Proposed Project's localized construction emissions to South Coast AQMD's recommended CEQA LSTs at 50 meters instead of those at 25 meters. Please see the attachment for more information. The attachment also includes a list of mitigation measures that are capable of reducing particulate matter emissions during construction as resources to the Lead Agency that should be reviewed for incorporation in the Final MND.

Conclusion

Pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15074, prior to approving the Proposed Project, the Lead Agency shall consider the MND for adoption together with any comments received during the public review process. Please provide South Coast AQMD with written responses to all comments contained herein

¹ MND. Section 4.3, *Air Quality*. Page 4.3-10.

² *Ibid.* Page 4.3-5.

³ *Ibid.* Section 2, *Project Description*. Page 2-12.

⁴ *Ibid.* Section 4.3, *Air Quality*. Page 4.3-1.

prior to the adoption of the Final MND. When responding to issues raised in the comments, response should provide sufficient details giving reasons why specific comments and suggestions are not accepted. There should be good faith, reasoned analysis in response. Conclusory statements unsupported by factual information do not facilitate the purpose and goal of CEQA on public disclosure and are not meaningful, informative, or useful to decision makers and the public who are interested in the Proposed Project. Further, if the Lead Agency makes a finding that the additional recommended mitigation measures are not feasible, the Lead Agency should describe the specific reasons for rejecting or substituting these mitigation measures in the Final MND (CEQA Guidelines Section 15074.1).

South Coast AQMD staff is available to work with the Lead Agency to address any air quality questions that may arise from this comment letter. Please contact Robert Dalbeck, Assistant Air Quality Specialist, at RDalbeck@aqmd.gov or (909) 396-2139, should you have any questions.

Sincerely,

Lijin Sun

Lijin Sun, J.D.

Program Supervisor, CEQA IGR

Planning, Rule Development & Area Sources

Attachment

LS:RD

LAC190502-06

Control Number

ATTACHMENT

Localized Construction Air Quality Impacts

1. The LSTs for a 1-acre project site in Source Receptor Area (SRA) 4 with sensitive receptors located within 25 meters⁵ were used to determine the level of significance for the Proposed Project’s localized construction air quality impacts. The Lead Agency used the localized significance thresholds for a 1-acre project site with sensitive receptors within 50 meters and found that the Proposed Project’s localized construction air quality impacts from NOx, CO, PM10, and PM2.5 would be less than significant [see Table A (circled in red)]. Since residential uses are located within 25 meters of the Proposed Project, the Lead Agency should compare the Proposed Project’s localized construction PM10 emissions (4.68 lbs/day) to South Coast AQMD localized air quality CEQA significance threshold for PM10 at 25 meters (4 lbs/day). Based on this comparison, the Proposed Project’s localized PM10 emissions would exceed the significance threshold [see Table B (circled in red)]. Therefore, South Coast AQMD staff recommends that the Lead Agency revise the LSTs analysis and identify mitigation measures in the Final MND. South Coast AQMD staff has compiled a list of mitigation measures that are capable of reducing particulate matter emissions during construction. Please see Comment No. 2 below.

Table A: South Coast AQMD Staff’s Copy of Table 4.3-3: Localized Significance of Emissions

Table 4.3-3 Localized Significance of Emissions				
Source	Pollutant (pounds/day)³			
	NOx	CO	PM10	PM2.5
Construction (Grading Phase)				
On-Site Emissions ¹	38.31	21.91	9.15	4.40
On-Site Emissions with SCAQMD Rules Applied ¹²	38.31	21.91	4.68	2.74
Localized Significance Threshold ²	47	789	13	5
Thresholds Exceeded?	No	No	No	No

Table B: South Coast AQMD Localized Significance Thresholds (LSTs) for SRA 4

SRA 4	NOx (lbs/day)	CO (lbs/day)	PM10 (lbs/day)	PM2.5 (lbs/day)
25 meters	57	585	4	3
50 meters	58	789	13	5
100 meters	68	1,180	29	10
200 meters	90	2,296	61	26
500 meters	142	7,558	158	93

*Note: The above table shows LSTs for a 1-acre project site located in SRA 4
Source: South Coast AQMD Staff, generated on 22 May, 2019*

Recommended Mitigation Measures for Localized Construction Air Quality Impacts

2. As discussed in Comment No. 1, the Proposed Project’s localized construction emissions from PM10 would exceed South Coast AQMD localized air quality CEQA significance threshold. The Lead Agency should identify mitigation measures to reduce this significant adverse air quality impact (CEQA Guidelines Section 15074.1). To assist the identification of feasible mitigation measures that

⁵ *Ibid.* Page 4.3-10.

are capable of reducing construction PM10 emissions, South Coast AQMD staff recommends that the Lead Agency incorporate the following mitigation measures in the Final MND.

- a. Require construction contractor(s) to use off-road diesel-powered construction equipment that meets or exceeds the California Air Resources Board (CARB) and U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (U.S. EPA) Tier 4 off-road emissions standards for equipment rated at 50 horsepower or greater during construction. Such equipment should be outfitted with Best Available Control Technology (BACT) devices including, but not limited to, a CARB certified Level 3 Diesel Particulate Filters (DPF). Level 3 DPFs are capable of achieving at least an 85 percent reduction in particulate matter emissions. A list of CARB verified DPFs are available on the CARB website. Additionally, the Lead Agency should include this requirement in applicable bid documents, and that successful contractor(s) must demonstrate the ability to supply compliant equipment prior to the commencement of any construction activities. A copy of each unit's certified tier specification and CARB or South Coast AQMD operating permit (if applicable) should be available upon request at the time of mobilization of each applicable unit of equipment. Additionally, the Lead Agency should require periodic reporting and provision of written documentation by contractors to ensure compliance, and conduct regular inspections to the maximum extent feasible to ensure compliance with this mitigation measure. If the Lead Agency finds that Tier 4 construction equipment is not feasible pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15364, the Project representative or contractor must demonstrate through future study with written findings supported by substantial evidence that is reviewed and approved by the Lead Agency before using other technologies/strategies. Alternative applicable strategies may include, but would not be limited to, Tier 3 construction equipment, reduction in the number and/or horsepower rating of construction equipment, limiting the number of daily construction haul truck trips to and from the Proposed Project, and/or limiting the number of individual construction project phases occurring simultaneously, if applicable.
- b. Maintain vehicle and equipment maintenance records for the construction portion of the Proposed Project. All construction vehicles must be maintained in compliance with the manufacturer's recommended maintenance schedule. All maintenance records shall remain on-site for a period of at least two years from completion of construction.
- c. Enter into a contract that notifies all construction vendors and contractors that vehicle idling time will be limited to no longer than five minutes or another time-frame as allowed by the California Code of Regulations, Title 13 section 2485 – CARB's Airborne Toxic Control Measure to Limit Diesel-Fueled Commercial Motor Vehicle Idling. For any vehicle that is expected to idle longer than five minutes, each project applicant, project sponsor, or public agency will require the vehicle's operator to shut off the engine. To further ensure that drivers understand the vehicle idling requirement, post signs at the entrance and throughout the site stating that idling longer than five minutes is not permitted.
- d. Encourage construction contractors to apply for South Coast AQMD "SOON" funds. The "SOON" program provides funds to applicable fleets for the purchase of commercially-available low-emission heavy-duty engines to achieve near-term reduction of NOx emissions from in-use off-road diesel vehicles. More information on this program can be found at South Coast AQMD's website: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/programs/business/business-detail?title=off-road-diesel-engines>.