



South Coast Air Quality Management District

21865 Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, CA 91765-4178
(909) 396-2000 • www.aqmd.gov

SENT VIA USPS AND E-MAIL:

staschner@cityofdhs.org

Scott Taschner, Senior Planner
City of Desert Hot Springs, Planning Department
65950 Pierson Boulevard
Desert Hot Springs, CA 92240

August 23, 2019

Site Plan Consultation for the Bubbling Wells Ranch Resort & Spa¹

South Coast Air Quality Management District (South Coast AQMD) staff appreciates the opportunity to comment on the above-mentioned project. South Coast AQMD staff's comments are recommendations regarding the analysis of potential air quality impacts from the Proposed Project that should be included in the CEQA document. Please forward a copy of the CEQA document directly to South Coast AQMD at the address in our letterhead. **In addition, please send with the CEQA document all appendices or technical documents related to the air quality, health risk, and greenhouse gas analyses and electronic versions of all air quality modeling and health risk assessment files². These include emission calculation spreadsheets and modeling input and output files (not PDF files). Without all files and supporting documentation, South Coast AQMD staff will be unable to complete a review of the air quality analyses in a timely manner. Any delays in providing all supporting documentation will require additional time for review beyond the end of the comment period.**

Air Quality Analysis

South Coast AQMD adopted its California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Air Quality Handbook in 1993 to assist other public agencies with the preparation of air quality analyses. South Coast AQMD staff recommends that the Lead Agency use this Handbook as guidance when preparing its air quality analyses. Copies of the Handbook are available from South Coast AQMD's Subscription Services Department by calling (909) 396-3720. More recent guidance developed since this Handbook was published is also available on South Coast AQMD's website here: [http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/ceqa-air-quality-handbook-\(1993\)](http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/ceqa-air-quality-handbook-(1993)). South Coast AQMD staff also recommends that the Lead Agency use the CalEEMod land use emissions software. This software has recently been updated to incorporate up-to-date state and locally approved emission factors and methodologies for estimating pollutant emissions from typical land use development. CalEEMod is the only software model maintained by the California Air Pollution Control Officers Association (CAPCOA) and replaces the now outdated URBEMIS. This model is available free of charge at: www.caleemod.com.

South Coast AQMD has also developed both regional and localized significance thresholds. South Coast AQMD staff requests that the Lead Agency quantify criteria pollutant emissions and compare the results to the recommended regional significance thresholds found here: <http://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default->

¹ According to the Project Description in the Site Plan, the Proposed Project consists of subdivision of 9.1 acres for future development of 110 resort rooms.

² Pursuant to the CEQA Guidelines Section 15174, the information contained in an EIR shall include summarized technical data, maps, plot plans, diagrams, and similar relevant information sufficient to permit full assessment of significant environmental impacts by reviewing agencies and members of the public. Placement of highly technical and specialized analysis and data in the body of an EIR should be avoided through inclusion of supporting information and analyses as appendices to the main body of the EIR. Appendices to the EIR may be prepared in volumes separate from the basic EIR document, but shall be readily available for public examination and shall be submitted to all clearinghouses which assist in public review.

[source/ceqa/handbook/scaqmd-air-quality-significance-thresholds.pdf](http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/scaqmd-air-quality-significance-thresholds.pdf). In addition to analyzing regional air quality impacts, South Coast AQMD staff recommends calculating localized air quality impacts and comparing the results to localized significance thresholds (LSTs). LSTs can be used in addition to the recommended regional significance thresholds as a second indication of air quality impacts when preparing a CEQA document. Therefore, when preparing the air quality analysis for the Proposed Project, it is recommended that the Lead Agency perform a localized analysis by either using the LSTs developed by South Coast AQMD or performing dispersion modeling as necessary. Guidance for performing a localized air quality analysis can be found at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/localized-significance-thresholds>.

The Lead Agency should identify any potential adverse air quality impacts that could occur from all phases of the Proposed Project and all air pollutant sources related to the Proposed Project. Air quality impacts from both construction (including demolition, if any) and operations should be calculated. Construction-related air quality impacts typically include, but are not limited to, emissions from the use of heavy-duty equipment from grading, earth-loading/unloading, paving, architectural coatings, off-road mobile sources (e.g., heavy-duty construction equipment) and on-road mobile sources (e.g., construction worker vehicle trips, material transport trips). Operation-related air quality impacts may include, but are not limited to, emissions from stationary sources (e.g., boilers), area sources (e.g., solvents and coatings), and vehicular trips (e.g., on- and off-road tailpipe emissions and entrained dust). Air quality impacts from indirect sources, such as sources that generate or attract vehicular trips, should be included in the analysis.

In the event that the Proposed Project generates or attracts vehicular trips, especially heavy-duty diesel-fueled vehicles, it is recommended that the Lead Agency perform a mobile source health risk assessment. Guidance for performing a mobile source health risk assessment (“*Health Risk Assessment Guidance for Analyzing Cancer Risk from Mobile Source Diesel Idling Emissions for CEQA Air Quality Analysis*”) can be found at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/mobile-source-toxics-analysis>. An analysis of all toxic air contaminant impacts due to the use of equipment potentially generating such air pollutants should also be included.

In addition, guidance on siting incompatible land uses (such as placing homes near freeways) can be found in the California Air Resources Board’s *Air Quality and Land Use Handbook: A Community Health Perspective*, which can be found at the following internet address: <http://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/handbook.pdf>. CARB’s Land Use Handbook is a general reference guide for evaluating and reducing air pollution impacts associated with new projects that go through the land use decision-making process. Guidance³ on strategies to reduce air pollution exposure near high-volume roadways can be found at: https://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/rd_technical_advisory_final.PDF.

Mitigation Measures

In the event that the Proposed Project generates significant adverse air quality impacts, CEQA requires that all feasible mitigation measures that go beyond what is required by law be utilized during project construction and operation to minimize these impacts. Pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15126.4(a)(1)(D), any impacts resulting from mitigation measures must also be discussed. Several resources are available to assist the Lead Agency with identifying possible mitigation measures for the Proposed Project, including:

³ In April 2017, CARB published a technical advisory, *Strategies to Reduce Air Pollution Exposure Near High-Volume Roadways: Technical Advisory*, to supplement CARB’s *Air Quality and Land Use Handbook: A Community Health Perspective*. This technical advisory is intended to provide information on strategies to reduce exposures to traffic emissions near high-volume roadways to assist land use planning and decision-making in order to protect public health and promote equity and environmental justice. Accessed at: <https://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/landuse.htm>.

- Chapter 11 “Mitigating the Impact of a Project” of South Coast AQMD’s *CEQA Air Quality Handbook*.
- South Coast AQMD’s CEQA web pages at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/mitigation-measures-and-control-efficiencies>.
- South Coast AQMD’s Rule 403 – Fugitive Dust, and the Implementation Handbook for controlling construction-related emissions.
- California Air Pollution Control Officers Association (CAPCOA)’s *Quantifying Greenhouse Gas Mitigation Measures* available here: <http://www.capcoa.org/wp-content/uploads/2010/11/CAPCOA-Quantification-Report-9-14-Final.pdf>.
- Other measures to reduce air quality impacts from land use projects can be found in South Coast AQMD’s Guidance Document for Addressing Air Quality Issues in General Plans and Local Planning: <http://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/planning/air-quality-guidance/complete-guidance-document.pdf>.

Alternatives

In the event that the Proposed Project generates significant adverse air quality impacts, CEQA requires the consideration and discussion of alternatives to the project or its location which are capable of avoiding or substantially lessening any of the significant effects of the project. The discussion of a reasonable range of potentially feasible alternatives, including a “no project” alternative, is intended to foster informed decision-making and public participation. Pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15126.6(d), the CEQA document shall include sufficient information about each alternative to allow meaningful evaluation, analysis, and comparison with the Proposed Project.

Permits

In the event that the Proposed Project requires a permit from South Coast AQMD, South Coast AQMD should be identified as a Responsible Agency for the Proposed Project in the CEQA document. For more information on permits, please visit South Coast AQMD’s webpage at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/permits>. If there are permitting questions, they can be directed to Engineering and Permitting Staff at (909) 396-3385.

Data Sources

South Coast AQMD rules and relevant air quality reports and data are available by calling South Coast AQMD’s Public Information Center at (909) 396-2039. Much of the information available through the Public Information Center is also available via South Coast AQMD’s webpage (<http://www.aqmd.gov>).

South Coast AQMD staff is available to work with the Lead Agency to ensure that project air quality and health risk impacts are accurately evaluated and mitigated where feasible. If you have any questions regarding this letter, please contact me, at lsun@aqmd.gov.

Sincerely,

Lijin Sun

Lijin Sun, J.D.

Program Supervisor, CEQA IGR

Planning, Rule Development & Area Sources