



# South Coast Air Quality Management District

21865 Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, CA 91765-4178  
(909) 396-2000 • www.aqmd.gov

## ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES

Wednesday, August 10, 2022  
2:00 p.m.

### 1. Welcome and Introductions

Dr. Sarah Rees, Deputy Executive Officer of South Coast AQMD's Planning, Rule Development, and Implementation Division, called the virtual meeting to order at 2:02 p.m.

### 2. Draft Health Effects Analysis

Dr. Rees presented the draft analysis of the health effects associated with criteria pollutants, described in detail in Appendix I of the Draft 2022 Air Quality Management Plan (AQMP). She also presented the USEPA's recent review on PM and ozone National Ambient Air Quality Standards (NAAQS) as well as the Advisory Council mechanics and objectives.

#### Comments from Advisory Council and Staff Responses:

*Ana Gonzalez requested clarification on the purpose of the Advisory Council.* Staff explained the function of the Advisory Council is established in the California Health and Safety Code and is focused on advising staff on health effects as staff evaluates and incorporates them into the Draft 2022 AQMP. The control strategy and other AQMP related inquiries are discussed through separate public processes such as Working Groups and AQMP and STMPR Advisory Groups.

*Ken Chawkins asked about the comparative air quality impacts on race, ethnicity, and geographic location.* Staff responded that ozone is a secondary pollutant which takes time to form and primarily affects locations downwind from emission source areas. Thus, impacts are usually not disproportionate for residents who live adjacent to highways and large industrial facilities. Nevertheless, staff will evaluate any disproportionate health impacts and health benefits as part of the socioeconomic analysis for the 2022 AQMP. Health effects on environmental justice communities and sensitive groups are also addressed in Chapter 8 and Appendix I of the 2022 AQMP, respectively.

*Natalie Hernandez asked for more information on the health impacts associated with extreme heat events and how they are addressed in this analysis.* Staff acknowledged that heat events can degrade air quality and that there could be synergistic health effects associated with high temperatures and air pollution, especially for sensitive groups. Staff will further investigate these impacts.

*Yassi Kavezade inquired regarding the socioeconomic analysis, including health cost savings and health benefits, as well as how the health benefits from this AQMP influence control measures/rulemaking.* Staff responded that the 2016 AQMP socioeconomic analysis evaluated health cost savings and health benefits in attaining federal air quality standards. The 2022 AQMP socioeconomic analysis is under development and will be released for public review this fall. Staff concurred that conducting a health benefit analysis for rules, especially those that achieve significant reductions, is an important exercise and will be considered.

*Yassi Kavezade asked if staff could clarify how this plan will achieve interim emission reductions while ensuring that control measures are as specific as possible.* Staff responded that South Coast AQMD has an obligation under California law to take all feasible measures to reduce emissions as expeditiously as practicable. Staff further strives to ensure that control measures are defined and as specific as possible, while recognizing that some measures cannot be very specific (e.g., black box measures).

*Bonnie Holmes-Gen suggested to refer to a joint comment letter by CARB and OEHHA to USEPA regarding the need to strengthen the ozone NAAQS, and more recent (2019 to present) studies/research on health effects, especially in disadvantaged communities.* Staff welcomed the suggestion to include more literature in the analysis and offered to cite the referenced letter in the appendix.

*Jennifer Bullard requested clarification regarding the release of the socioeconomic analysis and the Advisory Council's role in reviewing the analysis.* Staff responded that the Advisory Council's role is to focus on the health effects, while the socioeconomic analysis will follow a separate process to accommodate public review and comment.

*Dr. Xiangmei (May) Wu asked if research published subsequent to USEPA's 2019 Integrated Science Assessment (ISA) was considered. She also asked about cumulative health impacts of multiple air pollutants.* Staff responded that recent research was included in the review, but welcomed the inclusion of additional publications that may have been missed. Regarding cumulative, multipollutant health effects, staff responded that there are indeed cumulative effects, but the difficulty lies in the quantification and evaluation of those effects. Any suggestions on approaches were welcomed.

*Adonis Galarza inquired regarding how toxics and criteria air pollutants have affected sensitive age groups and the impact of a dried lakebed on air quality and exposure.* Staff responded that the South Coast AQMD operates a comprehensive air pollutant monitoring network that includes the Salton Sea. However, this AQMP focuses on man-made emissions and reducing those emissions. The impacts associated with the Salton Sea are analyzed separately. Staff offered to share studies investigating health impacts on sensitive populations.

*Ana Gonzalez asked about the exposure to diesel emissions and the increasing diesel VMTs associated with warehouse proliferation.* Staff responded that PM levels, including diesel PM, will decrease over time due to various regulations and programs on fleets, even if VMT from heavy-duty trucks increases. The Multiple Air Toxics Exposure Study provides more details on the diesel PM related health effects.

*Jo Kay Ghosh asked if the growth in VMT is accounted for in emissions projection and control measures.* Staff confirmed that detailed VMT growth projections by vehicle type are included in the 2022 AQMP.

*David Rothbart expressed a need to discuss the limitations of South Coast AQMD's regulatory authority and the influence of certain sources on the mortality rate.* Staff responded that this topic would be better suited for discussion in the context of the socioeconomic analysis results. Staff may consider reconvening the Advisory Council once the analysis is published.

*Jo Kay Ghosh requested clarification on the reason why wildfire health impacts and COVID health outcomes are carved out in their own section.* Staff responded that those topics were separated because they are emerging issues of interest.

*Ana Gonzalez asked when the next AQMP Advisory Group meeting would be scheduled.* Staff responded that an AQMP Advisory Group meeting has not been scheduled yet, but the next AQMP-related events are the regional public hearings in October.

*Ken Chawkins asked what South Coast AQMD staff considers to be the overarching feedback and critical items to take away from this Advisory Council meeting. He also emphasized the importance of race and ethnicity in the socioeconomic analysis.* Staff responded that there is a tremendous amount of interest in the socioeconomic analysis to see the connection between what the health impacts are, how they manifest in the area, and what the benefits are. There were also some comments on synergistic effects, particularly effects between the overlap of higher temperatures and the associated effects on air pollution. Staff confirmed that race and ethnicity will be considered.

*Bonnie Holmes-Gen reiterated that there is missing information in the USEPA's ISAs which needs to be reflected in this health effects analysis to provide a more comprehensive picture of the health impacts. She also requested to confirm if there is an additional meeting that discusses how the health appendix information was used in the socioeconomic analysis.* Staff responded that results from other literature that was published after the most recent ISA supplements would be incorporated into Appendix I. Staff also confirmed that there will be an additional meeting regarding the socioeconomic analysis.

*Jennifer Bullard requested to see the health effects of pollutants by agency jurisdiction (e.g., federal, state, regional).* Staff noted the comment.

*Irene Burga requested clarification regarding the sources of pollution and the health effects associated with those sources.* Staff responded that detailed information on the emissions inventory is in Appendix III of the 2022 AQMP.

Comments from Public and Staff Responses:

*Laura Rosenberger inquired on the level of pollution from incinerators in comparison to the air pollution in general, the link between Alzheimer's and air pollution, and the impact of lead poisoning on brain cells.* Staff responded that South Coast AQMD does not disaggregate pollution associated with incinerators; however, there are a variety of air toxics associated with incinerators. They are subject to permitting requirements, controls installed, and emission minimization requirements. Some studies suggest a link between Alzheimer's and fine particulate matter. This is an emerging area of research. Leaded paint was not phased out until 1978, but it is still present in old housing stock and apartments. Thus, children are still being exposed and it is an issue that South Coast AQMD is aware of.

*Gloria Cruz inquired whether health impacts are based on hospitalization data, as this may underrepresent non-English speaking communities who do not seek medical care or do so at local community clinics.* Staff responded that the socioeconomic analysis of the 2022 AQMP is not based on actual hospitalization rates. Rather, the socioeconomic impact analysis uses models based on literature that shows the relationships between different pollutants and the associated health impacts to estimate hospitalizations, premature deaths, and other health impacts from air pollution.

*Gloria Cruz also inquired if there has been analysis regarding the type of pollutants and emission rates in communities near railroads and how emissions from locomotives are quantified.* Staff responded that South Coast AQMD is currently in the rulemaking process for railyards and is seeking to gain a better understanding of railyard emissions. Staff is aware of the increase in railroad activity and uses growth factors to predict future activity for railyards and other emission sectors.

*Gabriela Mendez inquired regarding opportunities for conducting outreach in Environmental Justice communities (e.g., health fairs) to help collect data on hospitalization rates.* Staff responded that data on hospitalization rates or public health metrics are not collected, but staff welcomes ideas to improve outreach so that people are more aware of the impacts of air quality on their health.

### **3. Other Businesses**

No additional comments, announcements, or reports from the Advisory Council members.

### **4. Public Comment**

#### Comments from Advisory Council and Staff Responses:

No comments from the Advisory Council on this agenda item.

#### Comments from Public and Staff Responses:

No comments from the Public on this agenda item.

### **Members Present (15)**

Adonis Galarza, Alianza Coachella Valley

Ana Gonzalez, Center for Community Action and Environmental Justice

Bill La Marr, California Alliance of Small Business

Bonnie Holmes-Gen, California Air Resources Board (CARB)

David Rothbart, The Los Angeles County Sanitation Districts and Southern California Alliance of Publicly Owned Treatment Works

Greg Osterman, Jet Propulsion Laboratory, NASA

Irene Burga, GreenLatinos

Jennifer Bullard, Orange County Business Council

Jo Kay Ghosh, Heluna Health

Ken Chawkins, Chawkin Communications Consulting

Michael Keinman, University of California, Irvine

Scott Weaver, Ramboll

Natalie Hernandez, Climate Resolve

Yassi Kavezade, Sierra Club

Xiangmei (May) Wu, Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment

### **Public Attendees and Interested Parties (54)**

Alan Caldwell

Alison Torres, Eastern Municipal Water District

Amy Jeffries

Amy Lilly, Mercedes-Benz

Advisory Council Minutes for August 10, 2022

Anthony Bonilla  
Archana Agrawal  
Bill Quinn  
Craig Sakamoto, PBF Energy  
Curtis Coleman, Southern California Air Quality Alliance  
Dean West  
Dinh Quach, CARB  
Nichole Quick  
Peter Evangelakis, REMI  
Gabriela Mendez  
Gloria Cruz  
Ih Shan  
Jamie Bartolome  
Janet Bernabe  
Joaquin Catillejos  
John Heintz  
John Henkelman, Ventra County APCD  
John Peherson  
Julia Lester, Ramboll  
Karin Fickerson  
Kim Fuentes  
Kristy Monji-Chung  
Lakshmi Jayaram, Ramboll  
Laura Rosenberger  
Lauren De Valencia  
Lauren Nevitt, Sunrun  
Lee Kindberg, Maersk  
Les Swizer  
Leslie Velasquez  
Lijin Sun, SCAG  
Liz Sena  
Lori Huddleston, LA Metro  
Luis Amezcua  
Mark Abramowitz  
Mark Taylor  
Marven Norman, CCAEJ  
Mary Valdeman, Yuhaaviatam/Serrano Land  
Patty Senecal, Western States Petroleum Association  
Peter Okuroswki  
Ramine Cromartie, Western States Petroleum Association  
Resa Barilla  
Richard Parks, Redeemer Community Partnership  
Robert Freeman, LAWA  
Scott King, CARB  
Shayne Seever  
Steven Slater  
Steven Wadding

Thomas Jelenić  
Tim French  
Ursula Lai

**South Coast AQMD Staff Present (23)**

Alicia Lizarraga, Senior Public Affairs Manager  
Anthony Tang, Information Technology Supervisor  
Barbara Baird, Chief Deputy Counsel  
Barbara Radlein, Program Supervisor  
Brian Choe, Program Supervisor  
Britney Gallivan, Acting Program Supervisor  
Daphne Hsu, Principal Deputy District Counsel  
Elham Baranizadeh, AQ Specialist  
Emily Yen, AQ Specialist  
Farzaneh Khalaj, Assistant AQ Specialist  
Ian MacMillan, Assistant Deputy Executive Officer  
Jong Hoon Lee, AQ Specialist  
Kathryn Roberts, Deputy District Counsel II  
Kayla Jordan, Assistant AQ Specialist  
Kevin Ni, AQ Specialist  
Khadeeja Abdullah, Contractor  
Lane Garcia, Program Supervisor  
Marc Carreras-Sospedra, AQ Specialist  
Ranil Dhammapala, Senior Meteorologist  
Rosalee Mason, Administrative Assistant I  
Sang-Mi Lee, Planning and Rules Manager  
Sarah Rees, Deputy Executive Officer  
Sina Taghavaee, AQ Specialist